

# Soil nitrogen transformations under *Populus tremuloides*, *Betula papyrifera* and *Acer saccharum* following 3 years exposure to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub>

WILLIAM E. HOLMES\*, DONALD R. ZAK\*, KURT S. PREGITZER† and JOHN S. KING‡

\*School of Natural Resources and Environment, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, MI 48109-1115, †School of Forestry and Environmental Science, Michigan Technological University, Houghton, MI 49931, USA

## Abstract

Increases in atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> and tropospheric O<sub>3</sub> may affect forest N cycling by altering plant litter production and the availability of substrates for microbial metabolism. Three years following the establishment of our free-air CO<sub>2</sub>-O<sub>3</sub> enrichment experiment, plant growth has been stimulated by elevated CO<sub>2</sub> resulting in greater substrate input to soil; elevated O<sub>3</sub> has counteracted this effect. We hypothesized that rates of soil N cycling would be enhanced by greater plant productivity under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>, and that CO<sub>2</sub> effects would be dampened by O<sub>3</sub>. We found that elevated CO<sub>2</sub> did not alter gross N transformation rates. Elevated O<sub>3</sub> significantly reduced gross N mineralization and microbial biomass N, and effects were consistent among species. We also observed significant interactions between CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub>: (i) gross N mineralization was greater under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> (1.0 mg N kg<sup>-1</sup> day<sup>-1</sup>) than in the presence of both CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> (0.5 mg N kg<sup>-1</sup> day<sup>-1</sup>) and (ii) gross NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> immobilization was also greater under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> (0.8 mg N kg<sup>-1</sup> day<sup>-1</sup>) than under CO<sub>2</sub> plus O<sub>3</sub> (0.4 mg N kg<sup>-1</sup> day<sup>-1</sup>). We used a laboratory <sup>15</sup>N tracer method to quantify transfer of inorganic N to organic pools. Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> led to greater recovery of NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-<sup>15</sup>N in microbial biomass and corresponding lower recovery in the extractable NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> pool. Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> resulted in a substantial increase in NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-<sup>15</sup>N recovery in soil organic matter. We observed no O<sub>3</sub> main effect and no CO<sub>2</sub> by O<sub>3</sub> interaction effect on <sup>15</sup>N recovery in any soil pool. All of the above responses were most pronounced beneath *Betula papyrifera* and *Populus tremuloides*, which have grown more rapidly than *Acer saccharum*. Although elevated CO<sub>2</sub> has increased plant productivity, the resulting increase in plant litter production has yet to overcome the influence of the pre-existing pool of soil organic matter on soil microbial activity and rates of N cycling. Ozone reduces plant litter inputs and also appears to affect the composition of plant litter in a way that reduces microbial biomass and activity.

*Keywords:* *Acer*, *Betula*, CO<sub>2</sub>, immobilization, mineralization, <sup>15</sup>N, N cycling, O<sub>3</sub>, *Populus*

*Received 4 December 2001; revised version received 27 January 2003 and accepted 14 March 2003*

## Introduction

The concentrations of carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>) and ozone (O<sub>3</sub>) in the Earth's troposphere are expected to increase over the next century due to fossil fuel burning and the conversion of forests to other land uses (Keeling *et al.*, 1995; Finlayson-Pitts & Pitts, 1997; Fowler *et al.*, 1998; Stevenson *et al.*, 1998). The combined effects of greater

CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> on ecosystem carbon (C) and nitrogen (N) cycling are difficult to predict, because CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> affect plant growth in opposing ways. While greater CO<sub>2</sub> stimulates photosynthesis and the growth of many temperate tree species (Curtis, 1996; Curtis & Wang, 1998), greater O<sub>3</sub> could decrease photosynthesis and the growth of some species (Wang *et al.*, 1986; Coleman *et al.*, 1995a; Karnosky *et al.*, 1998) by inducing foliar damage and accelerating leaf senescence (Karnosky, 1976; Karnosky *et al.*, 1996). Further complicating the matter is the fact that tree species differ in their

Correspondence: William E. Holmes, tel. +1 734 647 5925, fax +1 734 936 2195, e-mail: bholmes@umich.edu

responsiveness to CO<sub>2</sub> and in their susceptibility to O<sub>3</sub> damage. Thus, forest net primary productivity may be enhanced by increasing atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> (DeLucia *et al.*, 1999), but it is uncertain how a concomitant increase in tropospheric O<sub>3</sub> will alter plant productivity, litter production and, in turn, ecosystem C and N cycling.

Rates of soil N cycling may be altered by the influence of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> on plant litter production, which controls substrate availability for heterotrophic microbial metabolism. There is considerable uncertainty regarding how changes in microbial activity under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> will influence soil N cycling (Zak *et al.*, 2000a), and we know little of the relationship between plant response to elevated O<sub>3</sub> and soil microbial activity (Islam *et al.*, 2000). We have been studying the influence of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> on the growth of ecologically contrasting temperate tree species at the Forest–Atmosphere Carbon Storage and Transfer (FACTS-II) FACE experiment near Rhinelander, WI, USA. Our results to date suggest that changes in plant production resulting from our treatments have altered the input and metabolism of plant litter by soil microbial communities. Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> has increased the production of leaf and fine root litter (King *et al.*, 2001; Lindroth *et al.*, 2001), which has resulted in greater rates of microbial respiration and increased activities of extracellular enzymes involved with the degradation of plant and fungal cell wall components (i.e. cellobiohydrolase and *N*-acetylglucosamidase; Larson *et al.*, 2002; Phillips *et al.*, 2002). The magnitude of this response varied between early-successional (i.e. *Populus tremuloides* and *Betula papyrifera*) and late-successional (*Acer saccharum*) tree species, but the presence of elevated O<sub>3</sub> eliminated the influence of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> on microbial activity. A greater metabolic capability to degrade plant and fungal litter under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> suggests that microbial communities have a greater biosynthetic demand for N, which could potentially decrease N availability to plants and increase the movement of N into soil organic matter. However, this may be counteracted by elevated O<sub>3</sub>.

Our primary objective was to determine how elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> alter the cycling of N among soil solution, microbial communities, and soil organic matter. We measured gross N transformation rates and traced inorganic <sup>15</sup>N transfer into microbial biomass and organic matter in soil beneath stands of *P. tremuloides*, *B. papyrifera*, and *A. saccharum* growing under free-air CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> enrichment treatments. Because the growth response of these temperate trees varies under elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub>, we reasoned that the changes in microbial activity and soil N cycling would be governed by the response of the dominant vegetation to our experimental treatments.

## Methods

### *Experimental design and field sampling*

We studied soil <sup>15</sup>N transformations at the FACTS-II FACE experiment (45°40.5'N, 89°37.5'E, 490 m elevation; Karnosky *et al.*, 1999; Dickson *et al.*, 2000). The site consists of 12–30 m diameter plots planted in 1997 with trembling aspen (*P. tremuloides* Michx.), paper birch (*B. papyrifera* Marsh.), and sugar maple (*A. saccharum* Marsh.). One-half of each plot is planted with five aspen genotypes that differ in O<sub>3</sub> sensitivity and leaf phenology (Coleman *et al.*, 1995a,b; Curtis *et al.*, 2000). One-quarter of each plot is planted with aspen and sugar maple, and the remaining quarter is planted with aspen and paper birch. All sections were planted at a density of 0.95 stems m<sup>-2</sup>, providing a total of 670 stems per 30 m diameter plot. Our study was confined to the central plot area. Soils are Alfic Haplorthods with a sandy loam Ap horizon overlaying a sandy clay loam Bt horizon. Soil physical and chemical properties have been summarized by Dickson *et al.* (2000).

Factorial CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> treatments were arranged in a randomized complete block design with three replicates (blocks). The split-plot effect consisted of the three sections differing in species composition (aspen, aspen–birch, and aspen–maple) within each plot. Fumigation gases are delivered to 32 vertical vent pipes spaced uniformly around the perimeter of each 30 m diameter plot. The control system maintains target CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> concentrations by regulating the release of fumigation gases from the upwind vent pipes. Fumigation occurs during the daylight hours for the duration of the growing season. In 1999, atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations were 346.5 LL<sup>-1</sup> in the ambient CO<sub>2</sub> plots and 547.8 LL<sup>-1</sup> in the elevated CO<sub>2</sub> plots. Atmospheric O<sub>3</sub> concentrations were 36.9 and 51.7 nLL<sup>-1</sup> in the ambient and elevated plots, respectively (Dickson *et al.*, 2000).

In July 1999, we collected six soil cores (2.5 cm *D*) to a depth of 10 cm from each split plot. Samples were combined by split plot, stored on ice, and were processed within 24 h of collection. All results are expressed on an oven-dry (105 °C) mass basis.

### *Soil N transformations*

We determined gross rates of N mineralization and nitrification (Davidson *et al.*, 1992; Hart *et al.*, 1994) and traced inorganic <sup>15</sup>N from soil solution into microbial biomass and soil organic matter. Soils were prepared by removing fine roots and coarse woody debris by hand and passing the remaining material through a 2 mm

mesh. Soil adhering to roots was removed during sorting and returned to the original sample, which was homogenized. From each soil sample, precisely 12.00 g ( $\pm 0.02$  g) was weighed into each of five glass vials (29 mm  $D \times$  94 mm  $H$ ). Two soil samples were enriched with precisely 1.00 mL ( $\pm 0.01$  mL) <sup>15</sup>N-NH<sub>4</sub>Cl solution, two were enriched with the same volume of <sup>15</sup>N-KNO<sub>3</sub> solution, and the remaining sample received 1.00 mL deionized water. The <sup>15</sup>N solutions were prepared using a mixture of <sup>15</sup>N-labeled (99.5%) and unlabeled N, which produced similar target concentrations of N (2–5 g N g<sup>-1</sup> soil) and <sup>15</sup>N (2–4 at.% excess <sup>15</sup>N) in both <sup>15</sup>NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>- and <sup>15</sup>NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-labeled soil. Isotope label solutions were added by pipetting evenly over the soil surface. The volume of the solution was adequate to disperse the label evenly throughout each 12 g sample, as indicated by uniform wetting of the entire soil volume, and to bring the soil samples to field capacity. Within 1 h after isotope addition, one of the pair of <sup>15</sup>NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-enriched samples and one of the pair of <sup>15</sup>NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-enriched samples were extracted with 2 M KCl and samples amended with deionized water were also extracted. The remaining <sup>15</sup>NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>- and <sup>15</sup>NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-enriched samples were incubated at 20 °C for 2 days, after which we extracted inorganic N with 2 M KCl.

We devised a sequential extraction procedure to isolate tracer <sup>15</sup>N within each soil N pool. In the first step, inorganic N (NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> and NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>) and dissolved organic nitrogen (DON) were separated from microbial N and soil organic N. Twenty milliliters of 2 M KCl was added to each sample in its original vial. The vials were capped, placed on a shaker for 20 min, and centrifuged for 15 min at 800 rpm. The supernatant was decanted into a 60 mL plastic syringe equipped with a 0.45 m filter attachment. The extraction was repeated with a second 20.0 mL aliquot of 2 M KCl. Particulate organic matter and suspended cells were removed from the solutions by forcing them through the 0.45 m filter. The filter from each syringe was placed back into the vial containing the corresponding soil. Filtrates were stored in 120 mL specimen cups at 4 °C prior to isotopic analysis.

A second extraction step was performed to separate microbial N and soil organic N. Vials containing soils and filters were fumigated with CH<sub>3</sub>Cl for 5 days in a vacuum desiccator. Residual CH<sub>3</sub>Cl was removed by repeated vacuuming (eight times) and 20.0 mL of 0.5 N K<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> was added to each vial. Vials were capped, placed on a shaker for 30 min, and centrifuged for 15 min at 800 rpm. The supernatant was decanted into a 120 mL specimen cup. This extraction was repeated with an additional 20.0 mL aliquot of 0.5 N K<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> and the extracts were frozen until they were digested to determine microbial N. The soil samples remaining in

the vials were dried to a constant weight at 60 °C in a forced-air oven. The dried soils were transferred to grinding jars and pulverized with stainless steel pins (0.5 cm  $D \times$  13.8 cm  $L$ ) in a roller mill (Model 755RMV, US Stoneware, East Palestine, OH, USA), and stored for analysis of organic N.

Ammonium-N and NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-N concentrations in KCl extracts were measured with a Flow Solution 3000 continuous flow analyzer (OI Analytical, College Station, TX, USA). Ammonium-N and NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-N were sequentially diffused from the KCl extracts onto acid traps in preparation for <sup>15</sup>N analysis using the method of Brooks *et al.* (1989). The acid traps were analyzed for atom% <sup>15</sup>N on a Finnigan Delta Plus isotope ratio mass spectrometer with a Conflo II interface (Thermo Finnigan, San Jose, CA, USA).

Microbial N within the K<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> extracts was determined by alkaline persulfate digestion (Cabrera & Beare, 1993). Blanks and glycine standards were digested simultaneously with samples. Nitrate-N concentrations in the digestates were measured with a continuous flow analyzer. Nitrate-N in the digested solutions was captured onto acid traps during a 5-day diffusion with MgO and Devarda's alloy. The acid traps were analyzed for atom% <sup>15</sup>N by isotope ratio mass spectrometry.

Soil organic N concentration was measured using a CE Instruments NC2500 elemental analyzer (CE Lantech, Lakewood, NJ, USA). Atom% <sup>15</sup>N in soil organic N was determined by isotope ratio mass spectrometry. We used the resulting N concentration and atom% <sup>15</sup>N data to calculate the recovery of <sup>15</sup>N label within inorganic N, microbial N, and soil organic N pools following the 2 day incubation. For each pool, we calculated atom% <sup>15</sup>N excess (APE) using atom% <sup>15</sup>N of the same pool in the water-amended control as background. We calculated the rates of gross N mineralization and nitrification and rates of gross N immobilization using the isotope pool dilution equations of Hart *et al.* (1994).

#### *Microbial biomass and soil organic C and N*

We measured microbial biomass using the chloroform fumigation–extraction procedure (Horwath & Paul, 1994). Soil samples were fumigated with chloroform for 5 days in a vacuum desiccator. Fumigated and control soils were extracted with 0.5 N K<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> (in a ratio of 4:1). Organic N in the extracts was determined by alkaline persulfate digestion followed by analysis of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-N on a continuous flow analyzer, as described above. Soil organic C and N concentrations were measured using an elemental analyzer, as described above.

### Statistical analyses

We tested the influence of elevated CO<sub>2</sub>, O<sub>3</sub>, and species composition on all pools, fluxes, and <sup>15</sup>N recoveries using an analysis of variance (ANOVA) for a randomized complete block, split-plot design with two factorial treatments, as described by King *et al.* (2001). In this design, species composition splits the main plot. When a particular *F*-test was significant, we compared means using Tukey's HSD multiple comparison procedure. The results were accepted as significant at *P* < 0.10.

## Results

### Gross N transformation rates

We observed a significant interaction between CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> on rates of gross N mineralization, wherein O<sub>3</sub> significantly reduced rates of N mineralization that occurred under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> (compare elevated CO<sub>2</sub> vs. elevated CO<sub>2</sub> + elevated O<sub>3</sub> means); NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> immobilization displayed an identical response (Table 1). Gross N mineralization was significantly reduced under elevated O<sub>3</sub> (*P* = 0.09, main effect), but was not influenced by CO<sub>2</sub> (main effect). The effect of O<sub>3</sub> on gross N mineralization was consistent among species and effects were most pronounced in aspen. The gross rates of nitrification and immobilization of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> were not affected by CO<sub>2</sub>, O<sub>3</sub>, or their interactions (Table 1). Species composition and the interaction of species

composition with CO<sub>2</sub> or O<sub>3</sub> had no significant effects on any of the gross N transformations that we measured.

### Distributions of <sup>15</sup>N among soil pools

The total recovery of NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-<sup>15</sup>N averaged 88.3 ± 8.19% and did not differ among experimental treatments (Table 2). Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> (main effect) significantly increased the recovery of NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-<sup>15</sup>N in microbial biomass (*P* = 0.05) and significantly reduced the recovery of NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-<sup>15</sup>N in the NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> pool (*P* = 0.10) relative to the ambient CO<sub>2</sub> treatment. Ozone (main effect) did not have a significant effect on the recovery of NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-<sup>15</sup>N in any soil pool. The interaction of CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> also had no effect on NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-<sup>15</sup>N recovery.

The recovery of NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-<sup>15</sup>N in soil organic N, microbial biomass, and NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> pools differed by species, such that species with greater recovery in the soil organic N and microbial biomass pools had lower recoveries in the NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> pool. Recoveries of NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-<sup>15</sup>N in the pools of microbial biomass (*P* < 0.01) and soil organic N (*P* = 0.05) were significantly greater in aspen compared with aspen-maple (Table 2). The recovery of NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-<sup>15</sup>N in the NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> pool was significantly lower in aspen and aspen-birch than in aspen-maple (*P* < 0.01, Table 2).

We observed significant species-by-O<sub>3</sub> interactions, indicating that the effect of O<sub>3</sub> on NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-<sup>15</sup>N recoveries in the NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> pool and soil organic N pool differed by species (data not shown). In aspen, O<sub>3</sub> led to a higher

**Table 1** Gross rates of N mineralization, nitrification, and microbial immobilization of NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> and NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> measured in a 2-day <sup>15</sup>N pool dilution experiment

	Interaction means				Main effect means			
	Ambient O <sub>3</sub>		Elevated O <sub>3</sub>		Ambient CO <sub>2</sub>		Elevated O <sub>3</sub>	
	Ambient CO <sub>2</sub>	Elevated CO <sub>2</sub>	Ambient CO <sub>2</sub>	Elevated CO <sub>2</sub>	Ambient CO <sub>2</sub>	Elevated CO <sub>2</sub>	Ambient O <sub>3</sub>	Elevated O <sub>3</sub>
	mg N kg <sup>-1</sup> day <sup>-1</sup>				mg N kg <sup>-1</sup> day <sup>-1</sup>			
Gross N mineralization	0.8ab (0.41)	1.0a (0.53)	0.8ab (0.25)	0.5b (0.27)	0.8 (0.33)	0.8 (0.48)	0.9 (0.47)	0.6* (0.29)
Gross nitrification	0.8 (0.29)	1.0 (0.38)	1.0 (0.39)	0.6 (0.22)	0.9 (0.35)	0.8 (0.36)	0.9 (0.34)	0.8 (0.37)
NH <sub>4</sub> <sup>+</sup> immobilization	0.5ab (0.33)	0.8a (0.44)	0.7ab (0.35)	0.4b (0.17)	0.6 (0.34)	0.6 (0.40)	0.6 (0.40)	0.5 (0.30)
NO <sub>3</sub> <sup>-</sup> immobilization	0.1 (0.23)	0.2 (0.30)	0.1 (0.13)	0.2 (0.26)	0.1 (0.18)	0.2 (0.27)	0.2 (0.26)	0.2 (0.20)

Values are means with standard deviations in parentheses. Significant differences among interaction means are indicated by letters. Means followed by the same letter do not differ significantly (*P* < 0.10). Significant CO<sub>2</sub> or O<sub>3</sub> main effects are denoted by asterisks (\**P* < 0.10; \*\**P* < 0.05).

**Table 2** Main effects of CO<sub>2</sub>, O<sub>3</sub>, and species composition on recoveries of <sup>15</sup>N following a 2-day laboratory incubation of soils amended with either <sup>15</sup>N-labeled NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> or <sup>15</sup>N-labeled NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>

	Ambient CO <sub>2</sub>	Elevated CO <sub>2</sub>	Ambient O <sub>3</sub>	Elevated O <sub>3</sub>	Aspen only	Aspen–birch	Aspen–maple
	%		%		%		
<sup>15</sup> NH <sub>4</sub> <sup>+</sup> amended soils							
Extractable NH <sub>4</sub> <sup>+</sup>	0.9 (0.98)	0.6 (1.28)	0.7 (1.21)	0.7 (1.08)	0.4 (0.65)	0.7 (1.15)	1.0 (1.46)
Extractable NO <sub>3</sub> <sup>-</sup>	35.9 (9.04)	27.8* (11.73)	34.2 (9.60)	29.6 (12.30)	26.7a (11.09)	29.29a (11.14)	39.6b (6.71)
Microbial biomass N	5.0 (0.88)	7.0** (1.92)	5.7 (1.05)	6.4 (2.28)	6.8a (1.84)	6.1ab (1.92)	5.3b (1.35)
Soil organic N	49.0 (7.49)	51.7 (10.38)	47.7 (9.10)	53.0 (8.37)	53.2a (10.76)	52.1ab (6.80)	45.6b (7.78)
Total <sup>15</sup> N recovery	90.3 (8.01)	86.3 (8.08)	87.9 (9.19)	88.6 (7.31)	87.0 (8.75)	87.8 (8.47)	90.1 (7.72)
<sup>15</sup> NO <sub>3</sub> <sup>-</sup> amended soils							
Extractable NH <sub>4</sub> <sup>+</sup>	0.0 (0.07)	0.0 (0.02)	0.0 (0.04)	0.0 (0.06)	0.0 (0.02)	0.0 (0.05)	0.0 (0.07)
Extractable NO <sub>3</sub> <sup>-</sup>	78.7 (14.33)	68.9 (14.98)	71.8 (14.55)	76.6 (16.06)	71.3ab (14.69)	67.7a (17.21)	82.5b (10.26)
Microbial biomass N	3.6 (1.65)	3.9 (2.15)	3.8 (2.36)	3.7 (1.21)	3.6 (1.71)	4.1 (2.24)	3.6 (1.78)
Soil organic N	7.8 (6.23)	14.2* (9.60)	10.3 (10.12)	11.3 (6.57)	11.4ab (7.22)	14.2a (11.47)	7.1b (4.96)
Total <sup>15</sup> N recovery	90.1 (11.00)	87.5 (8.25)	86.0 (8.25)	91.7 (10.36)	86.5a (9.38)	86.6a (9.33)	93.3b (9.45)

Values are mean recoveries (with standard deviations) of <sup>15</sup>N in pools of extractable NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> and NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>, microbial biomass N, and soil organic N. Significant CO<sub>2</sub> or O<sub>3</sub> main effects are denoted by asterisks (\**P* < 0.10; \*\**P* < 0.05). Species main effect means not followed by the same letter are significantly different (*P* < 0.10).

recovery of NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-<sup>15</sup>N in soil organic N and a lower recovery in the NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> pool. In contrast, no such trends were observed in aspen–birch. Although these species-by-O<sub>3</sub> interactions were significant, multiple comparisons did not indicate significant O<sub>3</sub> effects *within* any given species composition (i.e. the only significant contrasts were across species).

The total recovery of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-<sup>15</sup>N averaged 88.8 ± 9.67% and differed by species composition only (*P* = 0.02, Table 2). Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> (main effect) significantly increased the recovery of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-<sup>15</sup>N in soil organic N (*P* = 0.08). There was a corresponding decrease in the recovery of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-<sup>15</sup>N in the NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> pool, but it was not significant (*P* = 0.16). Ozone (main effect) and the interaction of CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> had no effect on the recovery of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-<sup>15</sup>N in any soil pool.

The distribution of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-<sup>15</sup>N among soil pools differed by species. The recovery of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-<sup>15</sup>N in the pool of soil organic N was greater in aspen–birch compared with aspen–maple (*P* = 0.10, Table 2). The recovery of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-<sup>15</sup>N in the NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> pool was lower in aspen–birch than in aspen–maple (*P* < 0.02, Table 2).

We observed significant species-by-O<sub>3</sub> interaction effects on NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-<sup>15</sup>N recoveries in the pools of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>, microbial biomass, and soil organic N. In aspen, elevated O<sub>3</sub> led to a greater recovery of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-<sup>15</sup>N in microbial biomass and soil organic N and a lower recovery in NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>. In aspen–birch, the effect of O<sub>3</sub> was the reverse – there was greater recovery of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-<sup>15</sup>N in NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> and lower recovery in microbial biomass and soil organic N. However, within-species contrasts were not significant.

#### Microbial biomass and soil C and N

Microbial biomass averaged 35.9 ± 9.43 mg N kg<sup>-1</sup> over all plots and was not affected by the interaction of CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> or the main effect of CO<sub>2</sub>. However, the main effect of O<sub>3</sub> was significant (*P* = 0.10). Microbial biomass was 15% lower under elevated O<sub>3</sub> (32.9 ± 7.12 mg N kg<sup>-1</sup>) compared with ambient O<sub>3</sub> (38.9 ± 10.64 mg N kg<sup>-1</sup>); this effect was consistent among species. Soil organic C and N were not significantly influenced by CO<sub>2</sub>, O<sub>3</sub>, species composition, or

their interactions. Soil organic C averaged  $18.0 \pm 3.39 \text{ g C kg}^{-1}$  and soil organic N averaged  $1.45 \pm 0.231 \text{ g N kg}^{-1}$  across all treatments.

## Discussion

Plant growth at the FACTS II FACE site has been strongly influenced by elevated atmospheric  $\text{CO}_2$  and  $\text{O}_3$  (Isebrands *et al.*, 2001; Karnosky *et al.*, 2003; Sober *et al.*, 2003). In 1999, fine root production and mortality were significantly greater under elevated  $\text{CO}_2$  compared with ambient  $\text{CO}_2$ , and the effects of  $\text{CO}_2$  were counteracted by elevated  $\text{O}_3$  (King *et al.*, 2001). Others have observed similar  $\text{CO}_2$  and  $\text{O}_3$  effects on cellulolytic and chitinolytic enzyme activity by soil microbial communities (Larson *et al.*, 2002; Phillips *et al.*, 2002), suggesting that changes in fine root turnover have altered belowground substrate availability for microbial metabolism.

Nevertheless, we found no significant main effect of elevated  $\text{CO}_2$  on microbial biomass N or gross rates of N transformations. In cases where we observed significant  $\text{CO}_2$ -by- $\text{O}_3$  interaction effects, there were no differences between the control and elevated  $\text{CO}_2$  treatments. This suggests that the effects of elevated  $\text{CO}_2$  alone (no  $\text{O}_3$ ) on plant biomass production and substrate inputs to soil were not sufficient to overcome the influence of the native pool of soil organic matter on microbial activity. This result is consistent with previous studies of gross N transformation rates beneath aspen exposed to elevated  $\text{CO}_2$  in open-top chambers for a similar length of time (Zak *et al.*, 2000b). Our experiment consists of aggrading stands of young trees, which still display a substantial growth response to  $\text{CO}_2$ . The effect of  $\text{CO}_2$  on soil N transformations could become significant if this growth response continues. Our results differ from observations at the Duke FACE site, which consists of loblolly pine stands at more advanced stages of development. There, the response plant growth to  $\text{CO}_2$  diminished 3 years following initiation of exposure to elevated  $\text{CO}_2$  (Oren *et al.*, 2001). In our study, we have no evidence to suggest that N availability will initially limit the  $\text{CO}_2$ -induced growth response in our experiment.

Ozone had significant negative effects on microbial biomass and N transformation rates. The influence of  $\text{O}_3$  was most distinct in the elevated  $\text{CO}_2$  treatments, wherein  $\text{O}_3$  significantly reduced gross N mineralization ( $-47\%$ ), gross  $\text{NH}_4^+$  immobilization ( $-54\%$ ), and microbial biomass ( $-23\%$ ). This suggests that  $\text{O}_3$  substantially modified the effect of  $\text{CO}_2$  on plant litter production. There is some evidence that  $\text{O}_3$  reduced aspen dead root production under elevated  $\text{CO}_2$  (King

*et al.*, 2001), but we have yet to determine whether  $\text{O}_3$  altered the chemical composition of belowground litter inputs in a way that would affect N transformation rates. Gross nitrification rates were unaffected by  $\text{CO}_2$  or  $\text{O}_3$  and were approximately equal to gross N mineralization rates across treatments and species. Thus, any N mineralized from organic matter and not taken up by plants is rapidly nitrified.

The tree species that we studied differ in life-history traits, litter production and biochemistry, and responsiveness to elevated  $\text{CO}_2$  and  $\text{O}_3$ . We hypothesized that the response of microbial activity would parallel species-specific changes in plant growth under elevated  $\text{CO}_2$  and  $\text{O}_3$ . In general, the response of plant production to  $\text{CO}_2$  and  $\text{O}_3$  was least in aspen-maple (Karnosky *et al.*, 2003); the N cycling responses that we observed display a similar pattern. The responses of gross N mineralization,  $\text{NH}_4^+$  immobilization, and microbial biomass to elevated  $\text{O}_3$  and the interaction of  $\text{CO}_2$  and  $\text{O}_3$  were similar in aspen, aspen-birch, and aspen-maple, but the magnitudes of responses were greatest in aspen and aspen-birch. Thus, at this point, we have no evidence that soil N cycling beneath the tree species in our experiment will respond differently to elevated  $\text{CO}_2$  and  $\text{O}_3$ .

In our  $^{15}\text{N}$  tracer experiment, the majority of  $^{15}\text{N}$  added as  $\text{NH}_4^+$  was incorporated into soil organic matter (50%) or converted to  $\text{NO}_3^-$  (32%) during the 2-day laboratory incubation. A small portion (6%) was recovered in soil microbial biomass. Microbial biomass is a dynamic pool and its  $^{15}\text{N}$  enrichment may not reflect the net amount of  $^{15}\text{N}$  that has passed through it during the incubation. Consequently, we cannot determine what proportion of the  $^{15}\text{N}$  recovered in soil organic N is attributable to microbial immobilization or whether the high  $^{15}\text{N}$  recoveries in soil organic matter resulted from abiotic N immobilization (Nömmik, 1965; Nömmik & Vahtras, 1982; Fog, 1988; Johnson *et al.*, 2000).

Elevated  $\text{CO}_2$  led to a 40% increase in recovery of  $\text{NH}_4^+$ - $^{15}\text{N}$  in microbial biomass and a corresponding decrease in  $\text{NH}_4^+$ - $^{15}\text{N}$  recovery in the  $\text{NO}_3^-$  pool. This likely resulted from greater substrate input under elevated  $\text{CO}_2$ . Greater heterotrophic N demand may have led to reduced  $\text{NH}_4^+$  availability to autotrophic nitrifying bacteria and, thus, reduced  $^{15}\text{N}$  recovery in the  $\text{NO}_3^-$  pool. Greater heterotrophic N demand reflects an increase in gross  $\text{NH}_4^+$  immobilization under elevated  $\text{CO}_2$ , although the increase we observed in this rate was not significant.

Most of the  $^{15}\text{N}$  added to soil in the form of  $\text{NO}_3^-$  was unmodified (74%), and the remainder was divided between microbial biomass (4%) and soil organic matter (11%). The recovery of  $\text{NO}_3^-$ - $^{15}\text{N}$  in soil organic N

increased by 100% in the aspen and aspen–birch, and by 50% in aspen–maple, in both elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and elevated CO<sub>2</sub> + O<sub>3</sub> treatments. Greater transfer of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-<sup>15</sup>N to soil organic N under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> (no O<sub>3</sub>) could result from greater plant litter inputs to soil (King *et al.*, 2001). However, greater transfer of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-<sup>15</sup>N to soil organic N under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> + O<sub>3</sub> cannot be explained by greater substrate inputs to soil and, thus, is more likely due to a change in the chemical composition of belowground litter inputs.

We found that elevated CO<sub>2</sub>, both alone and in combination with elevated O<sub>3</sub>, caused greater transfer of N from inorganic pools to organic pools. This could occur if the turnover of organic pools increased or if organic pools accumulated N. We found no significant increases in microbial N or soil organic N under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>, but it could take several years for such changes to become detectable. Our gross N mineralization and immobilization results indicate that microbial N turnover is greater under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> alone than under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> + O<sub>3</sub>. Thus, greater transfer of inorganic N to organic pools under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> + O<sub>3</sub> is not likely due to greater microbial N turnover, but may have resulted from changes in plant litter biochemistry or microbial community composition. Greater N accumulation in organic pools could be a sign of reduced N availability under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> + O<sub>3</sub>, but this may or may not further limit plant productivity under O<sub>3</sub>.

From our analyses, we conclude that tropospheric O<sub>3</sub> is an important factor modifying the response of both plants and soil microorganisms to elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>. We observed similar N cycling responses beneath ecologically distinct tree species, which were consistent with their individual growth responses to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub>. The changes that we observed in microbial biomass, gross N mineralization, and the transfer of N into soil pools appear to be driven by CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> effects on plant production and the production and chemical composition of plant litter. These results indicate that changes in plant growth due to climate change cascade rapidly through the ecosystem to influence microbial activity in soil. Understanding how changes in microbial activity will alter the long-term availability of N, which will feed back on plant growth responses to atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub>, remains elusive. To accomplish this, we need to understand the factors controlling the formation and degradation of soil organic matter over time scales longer than the duration of most current experiments (i.e. 3–6 years). Many of our most critical questions can only be addressed through continued long-term field research in conjunction with mechanistic models of ecosystem C and N dynamics.

## Acknowledgements

Our research was supported by grants from the Department of Energy's PER (DE-FG02-93ER6166) and TECO (DE-FG-2-95ERG2125) programs, as well as the USDA NRI Competitive Grants Program (2001-35107-11262) and the US Forest Service North Central Forest Experiment Station. We sincerely thank David Karnosky, Judd Isebrands, and George Hendry, and Jaak Sober who devoted numerous hours to the planning, construction, and maintenance of the Rhinelander FACE Experiment. We thank Matt Tomlinson, Andrea Firman, Noah Karberg, Lidia Szabo, and Christine Hura for assisting with laboratory work.

## References

- Brooks PD, Stark JM, McIneer BB *et al.* (1989) Diffusion method to prepare soil extracts for automated nitrogen-15 analysis. *Soil Science Society of America Journal*, **53**, 1707–1711.
- Cabrera ML, Beare MH (1993) Alkaline persulfate oxidation for determining total nitrogen in microbial biomass extracts. *Soil Science Society of America Journal*, **57**, 1007–1012.
- Coleman MD, Dickson RE, Isebrands JG *et al.* (1995a) Photosynthetic productivity of aspen clones varying in sensitivity to tropospheric ozone. *Tree Physiology*, **15**, 585–592.
- Coleman MD, Dickson RE, Isebrands JG *et al.* (1995b) Carbon allocation and partitioning in aspen clones varying in sensitivity to tropospheric ozone. *Tree Physiology*, **15**, 593–604.
- Curtis PS (1996) A meta-analysis of leaf gas exchange and nitrogen in trees grown under elevated carbon dioxide. *Plant, Cell and Environment*, **19**, 127–137.
- Curtis PS, Vogel CS, Wang X *et al.* (2000) Gas exchange, leaf nitrogen, and growth efficiency of *Populus tremuloides* in a CO<sub>2</sub> enriched atmosphere. *Ecological Applications*, **10**, 3–17.
- Curtis PS, Wang X (1998) A meta-analysis of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> effects on woody plant mass, form, and physiology. *Oecologia*, **113**, 299–313.
- Davidson EA, Hart SC, Firestone MK (1992) Internal cycling of nitrate in soils of a mature coniferous forest. *Ecology*, **73**, 1148–1156.
- DeLucia EH, Hamilton JG, Naidu SL *et al.* (1999) Net primary production of a forest ecosystem with experimental CO<sub>2</sub> enrichment. *Science*, **284**, 1177–1179.
- Dickson RE, Lewin KF, Isebrands JG, *et al.* (2000) *Forest atmosphere carbon transfer storage-II (FACTS II) – The aspen free-air CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> enrichment (FACE) project in an overview*. General Technical Report, NC-214, USDA Forest Service North Central Experiment Station.
- Finlayson-Pitts BJ, Pitts JN Jr (1997) Tropospheric air pollution: ozone, airborne toxics, polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons, and particulates. *Science*, **276**, 1045–1051.
- Fog K (1988) The effect of added nitrogen on the rate of decomposition of organic matter. *Biological Reviews of the Cambridge Philosophical Society*, **63**, 433–462.
- Fowler D, Flechard C, Skiba U *et al.* (1998) The atmospheric budget of oxidized nitrogen and its role in ozone formation and deposition. *New Phytologist*, **139**, 11–23.
- Hart SC, Stark JM, Davidson EA *et al.* (1994) Nitrogen mineralization, immobilization, and nitrification. In: *Methods of Soil Analysis Part 2 Microbiological and Biochemical Properties*

- (eds Weaver RW, Angle S, Bottomley P, Bezdicsek D, Smith S, Tabatabai A, Wollum A), pp. 985–1018. Soil Science Society of America, Segoe, WI, USA.
- Horwath WR, Paul EA (1994) Microbial biomass. In: *Methods of Soil Analysis Part 2 Microbiological and Biochemical Properties* (eds Weaver RW, Angle S, Bottomley P, Bezdicsek D, Smith S, Tabatabai A, Wollum A), pp. 753–773. Soil Science Society of America, Segoe, WI, USA.
- Isebrands JG, McDonald EP, Kruger E *et al.* (2001) Growth responses of *Populus tremuloides* clones to interacting elevated carbon dioxide and tropospheric ozone. *Environmental Pollution*, **115**, 359–371.
- Islam KR, Mulchi CL, Ali AA (2000) Interactions of tropospheric CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> enrichments and moisture variations on microbial biomass and respiration in soil. *Global Change Biology*, **6**, 255–265.
- Johnson DW, Cheng W, Burke IC (2000) Biotic and abiotic nitrogen retention in a variety of forest soils. *Soil Science Society of America Journal*, **64**, 1503–1514.
- Karnosky DF (1976) Threshold levels for foliar injury to *Populus tremuloides*. Michx. by sulfur dioxide and ozone. *Canadian Journal of Forest Research*, **6**, 166–169.
- Karnosky DF, Gagnon ZE, Dickson RE (1996) Changes in growth, leaf abscission, and biomass associated with seasonal tropospheric ozone exposures of *Populus tremuloides* clones and seedlings. *Canadian Journal of Forest Research*, **16**, 23–27.
- Karnosky DF, Mankovska B, Percy K *et al.* (1999) Effects of tropospheric O<sub>3</sub> on trembling aspen and interaction with CO<sub>2</sub>: results from an O<sub>3</sub>-gradient and a FACE experiment. *Water, Air, and Soil Pollution*, **116**, 311–322.
- Karnosky DF, Podila GK, Gagnon Z (1998) Genetic control of responses to interacting tropospheric ozone and CO<sub>2</sub> in *Populus tremuloides*. *Chemosphere*, **36**, 807–812.
- Karnosky DF, Zak DR, Pregitzer KS *et al.* (2003) Tropospheric O<sub>3</sub> moderates responses of temperate hardwood forests to elevated CO<sub>2</sub>: a synthesis of molecular to ecosystem results from the Aspen FACE project. *Functional Ecology*, **17**, 289–304.
- Keeling CM, Whort TP, Wahlen M *et al.* (1995) International extremes in the rate of rise of atmospheric carbon dioxide since. *Nature*, **375**, 666–670.
- King JS, Pregitzer KS, Zak DR *et al.* (2001) Fine root biomass and fluxes of soil carbon in young stands of paper birch and trembling aspen is affected by elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and tropospheric O<sub>3</sub>. *Oecologia*, **128**, 237–250.
- Larson J, Zak DR, Sinsabaugh RL (2002) Extracellular enzyme activity and metabolism of root-derived substrates beneath temperate trees growing under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub>. *Soil Science Society of America Journal*, **66**, 1848–1856.
- Lindroth RL, Kopper BJ, Parsons WFJ *et al.* (2001) Consequences of elevated carbon dioxide and ozone for foliar chemical composition and dynamics in trembling aspen (*Populus tremuloides*) and paper birch (*Betula papyrifera*). *Environmental Pollution*, **115**, 395–404.
- Nömmik H (1965) Ammonium fixation and other reactions involving a nonenzymatic immobilization of mineral nitrogen in soil. In: *Soil Nitrogen. Agronomy Monograph*, **10** (eds Bartholomew WV, Clark FE), pp. 198–257. ASA, Madison, WI.
- Nömmik H, Vahtras K (1982) Retention and fixation of ammonium and ammonia in soils. In: *Nitrogen in Agricultural Soils. Agronomy Monograph*, **22** (eds Stevenson FJ *et al.*), pp. 123–172. WI, ASA, CSSA, SSSA, Madison.
- Oren R, Ellsworth DS, Johnson KH *et al.* (2001) Soil fertility limits carbon sequestration by a forest ecosystem in a CO<sub>2</sub>-enriched atmosphere. *Nature*, **411**, 469–472.
- Phillips RL, Zak DR, Holmes WE (2002) Microbial community composition and function beneath temperate trees exposed to elevated atmospheric carbon dioxide and ozone. *Oecologia*, **131**, 236–244.
- Sober A, Noormets A, Kull O *et al.* (2003) Photosynthetic parameters of aspen grown with interacting elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and ozone concentrations as associated with leaf nitrogen. *Tree Physiology*, in press.
- Stevenson DS, Johnson CE, Collins WJ *et al.* (1998) Evolution of tropospheric ozone radiative forcing. *Geophysical Research Letters*, **25**, 3819–3822.
- Wang D, Karnosky DR, Bormann FH *et al.* (1986) Effects of ambient ozone on the productivity of *Populus tremuloides* Michx. Grown under field conditions. *Canadian Journal of Forest Research*, **16**, 47–55.
- Zak DR, Pregitzer KS, King JS *et al.* (2000a) Elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>, fine roots and the response of soil microorganisms: a review and hypothesis. *New Phytologist*, **147**, 201–222.
- Zak DR, Pregitzer KS, Curtis PS *et al.* (2000b) Atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>, soil-N availability, and allocation of biomass and nitrogen by *Populus tremuloides*. *Ecological Applications*, **10**, 34–46.